



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## AGENDA

**Pwyllgor** PWYLLGOR CRAFFU'R ECONOMI A DIWYLLIANT

**Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod** DYDD IAU, 13 MEDI 2018, 5.00 PM

**Lleoliad** YSTAFELL BWYLLGORA 4 - NEUADD Y SIR

**Aelodaeth** Cyngorydd Howells (Cadeirydd)  
Y Cynghorwyr Henshaw, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John, Parkhill, Robson, Sattar, Simmons a/ac Stubbs

Tua  
Amser.

### 1 Ymddiheuriadau am Absenoldeb

Derbyn ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb.

### 2 DATGANIADAU O FUDDIANT

Dylid gwneud hyn ar ddechrau'r eitem agenda dan sylw, yn unol â'r Cod Ymddygiad Aelodau.

### 3 Cofnodion (*Tudalennau 3 - 8*)

Cymeradwyo cofnodion y cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd ar 14 Mehefin 2018 fel gwir gofnod.

### 4 Diweddariad ar Aelodaeth Pwyllgor

### 5 Safle Arloesedd (*Tudalennau 9 - 18*)

5.00 pm

Clywed barn prifysgolion lleol ar rôl y Cyngor wrth ddarparu safle arloesedd yng Nghaerdydd.

### 6 Rhaglennu Gwaith a Darlledu Gwe (*Tudalennau 19 - 40*)

6.00 pm

Ystyried a chymeradwyo blaenraglen waith y Pwyllgor a nodi eitemau i'w gwe-ddarlledu o bosibl.

- 7      **Perfformiad: Papur Briffio – Datblygu Economaidd** (*Tudalennau 41 - 52*)      6.20 pm

Rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Aelodau am y dangosyddion perfformiad datblygu economaidd wedi'u hadrodd i'r pwyllgor craffu mewn nifer o ddinasoedd craidd eraill.

- 8      **Materion Brys (os o gwbl)**

- 9      **Y ffordd ymlaen**      6.40 pm

- 10      **DYDDIAD Y CYFARFOD NESAF**

11 Hydref 2018, 5.00pm

**Davina Fiore**

**Cyfarwyddwr Llywodraethu a Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol**

Dyddiad: Dydd Gwener, 7 Medi 2018

Cyswllt: Andrea Redmond, 02920 872434, [a.redmond@caerdydd.gov.uk](mailto:a.redmond@caerdydd.gov.uk)

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

14 JUNE 2018

Present: Councillor Howells(Chairperson)  
Councillors Gavin Hill-John, Robson, Sattar and Stubbs

1 : APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON & COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Committee noted that Council at its meeting held on 24 May 2018 appointed Councillor Nigel Howells as Chair and the following Members to this Committee:

Councillors Derbyshire, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John, Parkhill, Robson, Sattar, Simmons and Stubbs.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillors Derbyshire and Simmons as new Members to the committee.

2 : TERMS OF REFERENCE

The Committee noted the terms of reference.

3 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Derbyshire, Gordon. Parkhill and Simmons.

4 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None Received.

5 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 10 May 2018 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

6 : QUARTER 4 PERFORMANCE REPORT

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member – Culture & Leisure, Councillor Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member –Investment & Development, Councillor Sarah Merry, Deputy Leader, Education, Employment & Skills, Councillor Lynda Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing and Communities, Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development, and Sarah McGill, Corporate Director People and Communities to the meeting.

The Chairperson invited the Cabinet Member Housing and Communities to make a statement in which she said that Cardiff is a growing city, however inequality remains a major challenge. To enable our citizens to reach their potential, then it is these services that need to perform well and meet the needs of our citizens. This challenge is magnified by the changes that Welfare Reform and in particular Universal Credit are bringing. The Cabinet Member said she was proud to report that we have helped

over 42,000 receive into work advice; Supported nearly 1,4000 completing an accredited training; Engaged with 297 clients impacted by the benefit cap, of which 115 have secured employment. The quarter 4 report shows that libraries and hubs have received over 3.3 million visitors, with customer satisfaction of 98%. The Cabinet Member expressed her delight at this adding that it only tells part of the picture and only by visiting and seeing the whole community, using, enjoying and benefiting from the fantastic services can you truly understand the huge success that they have become.

The Chairperson invited the Cabinet Member Education, Employment & Skills to make statement in which she said that she was pleased that enrolment of Learning for Work had increased by 27%, there was 92% success rate which was above the set target and was targeting the more vulnerable learners. She added that there was one issue of concern in that the grant for Adult Community Learning would be dramatically reduced in the forthcoming year by more than 50%; this was currently out to consultation.

The Director for Economic Development stated that in relation to his area, most objectives had been reached, only 1 had not been and that was the unemployment target. He added that numbers had risen due to more people being in the work place with the introduction of Universal Credit.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members:

#### People and Communities

Members discussed the Council Staff Violence against Women target, noting it was a new target but hoped to see a dramatic improvement in the next year.

Members welcomed the increase in visitors to libraries and Hubs.

Officers made reference to the E-Learning routes for Domestic Violence training, where there had been some technical issues, they had been routed through Health colleagues and had been difficult to capture previously. Officers intend to keep an eye on this to ensure issues have been resolved.

Members made reference to the reduction in grant funding for ACL and asked if there was a contingency plan. Officers stated that the level of reduction would be extremely challenging and with current excellent results, it was a real concern. Officers would take the approach of maximising grant opportunities and integrated working to reduce the burden on the Council.

A cut of 50% could not be mitigated fully. Committee offered its support to officers regarding this, including help during the consultation phase in terms of offering their feedback re the good performance currently and the value of this.

#### Economic Development

Members referred to the unemployment target and noted that this was largely out of the Council's hands. Members discussed large stores leaving the City such as Toys R Us and Howells and asked what the Council could do to alleviate the impact on a local level and to encourage people to use the High Street. The Cabinet Member

stated that there were more people in work in Cardiff yet the number of people in the job market and seeking employment has grown due to Universal Credit. Officers added that they have created 20,000 new jobs yet the rate of unemployment has still grown. Members considered whether the target was accurate and whether we are measuring the correct indicators. Officers stated that they felt the indicators and targets were appropriate but were happy to listen to the views of the Committee if Members felt additional indicators would be helpful. Members discussed the issues with the High Street such as banks and Post Offices closing, people shopping online etc. Footfall in the City had been maintained but people were using the City for different things. It was important to be creative and draw people in to the City with such events as Car Free Day and build on the day-time economy as well as the night time economy. The Council was in discussion with the landlord of Howells and House of Fraser and was also considering revisiting the design of St Mary Street. In relation to the targets being appropriate, Officers explained that they have previously beaten the target due to one-off large projects but these are not guaranteed. Officers explained that the BID should help, with businesses working together to attract more visitors to the high street. Members queried whether Cardiff was experiencing the same patterns of footfall as elsewhere; were there lessons to learn from other cities?

With reference to paid attendance at the New Theatre and St David's Hall, Members noted that the figure was slightly lower than last year. Members were advised that paid attendance was still up; and were better in some parts of the year such as Christmas at St David's Hall. It was added that the subsidy had had to be pulled from St David's Hall and this had been a challenge, with a restructure underway.

Members stated that they would like Scrutiny to look at new tourism such as the Castle and Dr Who. Officers explained that the Council was close to agreement with Dr Who and Blacktower Tales and more information would be available in due course.

Members noted the numbers of visitors staying in the City and were surprised that it was slightly off target especially with the Champions League. Officers stated that the visitors staying overnight was 1.8% and the target was 2% but added that day visits went up substantially over target.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Cabinet Members in due course.

## 7 : ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTORATE DELIVERY PLAN

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member – Culture & Leisure, Councillor Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member – Investment & Development and Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development to the meeting.

Members were provided with a presentation after which the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members:

Members asked for more information on Incubator Space and were advised that Innovator/Incubator space was not really performing, officers are looking to work with

the University, seek planning permission, work with a contractor and look to change the landscape in Cardiff, establishing a proper research facility related to the University and Industry. The policy will be reviewed over the next few months to see if this alternative approach was needed.

Members noted the list of ambitions and asked if the Directorate had the resources needed to deliver on these. The Cabinet Member said it did not, but they would have to do what they had always done which was to persuade other people to use their resources to deliver the agenda. There would be a need to become more adept in years to come. All major projects in recent years delivered in Cardiff had been public/private partnerships.

Members asked how well staffed the directorate was and were advised that there were not enough people, the scale of savings made year on year had provided a very difficult challenge; there was a need to be innovative and find ways of doing things differently. The Cabinet Member added that decisions in the past had impacted on some relations which had made things harder to achieve this time around.

Members asked if there was capacity to look out Grants. Officers advised that they had never felt there was a capacity constraint, where the opportunity arose then they were applied for, adding that they don't apply for grants themselves as such but help other such as the Cardiff Story. He added there were lots of examples where they get things delivered by other people getting grants such as the Tramshed. It was noted that they always worked with other such as Friends Groups and Trusts who have access to funds.

The Cabinet Member Culture & Leisure added that sometimes the Council is precluded from applying for grants but they have been creative and he gave the example of Insole Court which he considered had worked exceptionally well. With reference to Capacity he gave the example of the Live Music Strategy and there being one Council Officer working to deliver this, stating that this is the reality of a discretionary service area when the Council is being squeezed.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Cabinet Members in due course.

## 8 : CARDIFF CAPITAL REGION CITY DEAL: JOINT OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE PROPOSALS

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader to the meeting.

The Chairperson invited the Leader to make a statement in which he said that the Committee needed to satisfy itself that the scrutiny arrangements in place for the City Deal are robust, adding that there is one Member per Authority, which reflects arrangements for other Joint Committees. He stated that Members would be aware that the City Deal agreed the joint business plan which reflects the competing expectations of the authorities i.e. thematic/project focussed; a compromise was evidenced in that business plan. Now that the business plan is agreed, it is important that Cardiff applies the same level of scrutiny it applies in Cardiff to the City Deal.

The Chairperson noted that Bridgend had been nominated as Lead Scrutiny and asked what rationale was behind that decision. The Leader stated that the decision was made at Chief Executive level, then accepted by Members, adding that Bridgend had the capacity to undertake the role. The Governance Lead is the Chief Executive of Merthyr and it makes sense to have different authorities as different Leads.

The Chairperson advised Committee that they have been asked specifically to provide views on certain areas and asked the Scrutiny Officer to provide an overview of these. The Scrutiny Officer explained that in relation to Statutory Guidance, this Committee should provide a view on whether there should be joint scrutiny, as it has the remit for scrutiny of City Deal; the Committee considered it should be.

Members were asked if they considered the Terms of Reference appropriate, they currently state that the Chair/Vice is selected alphabetically and rotate annually; the Statutory Guidance makes no reference to alpha order. The Chairperson considered that the nomination of the Chair and Vice should be a committee decision. The Scrutiny Officer advised that she would feed this into the comments to Council.

Members were advised that there needed to be a nominated representative (non-executive member), Scrutiny Chairs had been consulted on this and they considered the Chair of Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee should be the representative. Members discussed the length of appointment and noted that Cardiff appoints annually. Members also discussed the skill sets required for nominees, Members considered there should be Chairmanship experience, experience of City Deal and scrutiny experience.

A discussion took place about what mechanism exists for feeding back to Cardiff, the Scrutiny Officer explained that the Joint Overview/Scrutiny does not preclude authorities doing their own scrutiny; there are mechanisms in place to allow feedback, the feedback would be verbal and written feedback and would be from our representatives at the JOSC and supporting Officers.

Members were asked to consider the Independent Remuneration Panel recommendation that it is up to the respective local authority whether the Chair of the JOSC gets paid. Members considered that there may be a considerable amount of work involved. However, Members did not believe that there should be an additional payment on top of the payment already made to Scrutiny Chairs. The Scrutiny officers agreed to feedback those views.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Leader in due course.

## 9 : COMMITTEE BUSINESS

Members were provided with a correspondence update report, noting that there were no outstanding responses.

Members were provided with the Annual Report, it was explained that it followed the same format as previously, listing what has been scrutinised over the year and highlighting some of the work. Members were advised that this was an opportunity to make any changes prior to it being presented to full Council next week.

The Chairperson advised that as he would not be attending full Council, a member of the Committee would need to present the report in his absence. Councillor Gavin Hill-John was nominated to present the Annual Report to Council.

Members were asked to consider how they wished to proceed with work programming. The Scrutiny Officer advised Members of the ways in which this had been done in previous years, with a list of areas they wish to scrutinise, which is then prioritised. Councillor Stubbs stated he was keen to look at GLL and the impact on non-profit groups and public service groups who use the buildings. The Scrutiny Officer advised that there would likely be a long list of areas and that Committee would need to focus its time, bearing in mind the WAO recommendation of there being a balance of work at and outside committee, with committee meetings taking no longer than 3 hours.

Members considered that there should be an informal session after the July Committee meeting for a maximum of one hour.

RESOLVED: To note the report.

10 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

5<sup>th</sup> July 2018 at 4.30pm in Committee Room 4, County Hall, Cardiff.

The meeting terminated at 5.55 pm



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**13 SEPTEMBER 2018**

---

**INNOVATION AND WORKSHOP PREMISES: The role of the Council**

---

**Purpose of the Report**

1. To enable representatives from local universities to provide their views to Members on the role of the Council in the provision of innovation and workshop premises. The evidence provided at this meeting will be used to inform the ongoing Inquiry into the Council provision of Innovation and Workshop premises.
2. To provide Members of the Committee with background information to help shape discussions at the meeting with representatives from local universities.

**Background**

3. At the work-programming forum meeting on 5 July 2018, Committee Members agreed to hold an inquiry into the Council provision of workshop and innovation premises. The terms of reference for the Inquiry, attached at **Appendix A**, include hearing the views of stakeholders such as local universities.
4. Representatives from Cardiff University and the University of South Wales have been invited to attend this meeting to give their views. The Chair has also sent a letter to Cardiff Metropolitan University and other stakeholders, as detailed in **Appendix A**, seeking their views and offering them an opportunity to contribute to the inquiry.
5. In 2013/14, this Committee carried out a short scrutiny examining the role of higher education in Innovation. As part of this scrutiny, the following key points were made:

- i) Innovation is: the application of research for a benefit to the wider community, economy or for commercial benefit<sup>1</sup>; and the successful exploitation of new ideas, turning ideas into business or social capital
- ii) Innovation contributes directly to productivity growth and creates sustainable, high value jobs.
- iii) Higher Education establishments play an important role in driving local innovation and growth for a number of reasons, including<sup>2</sup>:

*Higher Education Institutions:*

- *attract people and businesses to an area*
- *develop knowledge bases*
- *are internationally wired – academics have global connections which can be harnessed for wider civic benefit*
- *are part of the “civic brand” – globally recognised and major hooks for inward investors.*
- *Universities help to commercialise innovation. Innovation accounts for 63% of annual labour productivity growth since 2002.*
- *For every £1 million of university output a further £1.38 million of output is generated in other sectors of the economy.*
- iv) The universities based in the city have links with other academic institutions and businesses around the world, from Silicon Valley in the USA, to Geel in Belgium, creating opportunities for the city and making Cardiff part of a global network of academics, entrepreneurs and businesses.
- v) The Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA) recognises the importance of local authority contributions to supporting higher education innovation. It states that, *“Local authorities also have a key role in terms of facilitating discussions between the higher and further education institutions and the business community in their areas in order to encourage better linkages so that the innovative activity of the HE and FE institution benefits the local economy and offers opportunities for young people to stay in their communities”*<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Comparison of the Welsh Innovation Offerings Against other areas of the UK, Welsh Government, 2012

<sup>2</sup> Higher Education Institutions and Local Government; Local Government Association, 2013

<sup>3</sup> WLGA response to Welsh Government consultation on Innovation Strategy for Wales, 2012

## **Current Council Provision**

6. The Council provides a range of advice and support to existing and new businesses interested in establishing themselves in Cardiff, including advice on identifying and securing loans, grants and equity from a range of organisations such as Welsh Government, Finance Wales, European Commission and specialist funding bodies.
7. In addition, the Council provides workshop units and is involved in the provision of incubator space via the Cardiff Business Technology Centre; details of these are provided below.

## **Cardiff Business Technology Centre (CBTC)**

8. The Council has a role in the Cardiff Business Technology Centre (CBTC), which is a wholly owned arm's length company of the Council. This operates as a separate legal entity, as a private company limited by guarantee, not having share capital and being self-financing. The company operates with an Advisory Board of Directors; the company structure and relationships align the goals and objectives of CBTC with the wider objectives of the Council's economic development.
9. CBTC operates two separate incubator sites for new-start and growing businesses, at Senghennydd Road, Cathays and at Capital Business Park, Wentloog. Each of these sites has different ownership and stakeholder interest as well as different criteria for potential tenants.
10. The CBTC at Senghennydd Road, provides incubator space for technology based businesses with flexible easy- in, easy-out lease terms. The accommodation can be adapted for a wide range of applications/business uses with individual units available from 142-777 sq. ft.; the flexibility to offer single or combined units enables the Centre to support businesses to grow and expand. The centre also provides hot-desk leases to student/ graduate enterprises. The Centre has private parking, conference and meeting room facilities, all with broadband connectivity, and audiovisual facilities. Average occupancy levels over the last few years are 89%.

11. The CBTC at Capital Business Park, Wentloog, provides services, accommodation and grow-on space for established and developing new technology companies. The site offer 26 units ranging in size from 256 sq. ft. to 1250 sq. ft., with the majority of the units being 950 sq. ft. and above. Average occupancy levels over the last few years have been 85%.

### **Council Workshop Provision**

12. Currently, the Council provides 139 workshops within the city, aimed at encouraging new and expanding local businesses by offering units with easy-in easy-out terms. The units range in size from 120 to 2,000 sq. ft. and are sited in disadvantaged wards in the southern arc of the city to encourage local employment opportunities.

#### **Sites**

Bessemer Workshops, Bessemer Close  
Douglas Buildings, Royal Stuart Lane  
Ely Brewery Workshops, Station Terrace  
Fairwater Workshops, Norbury Road  
Gabalfa Workshops, Clos Mentor  
Lamby Workshops, Lamby Way  
Royal Stuart Workshops, Adelaide Place  
Splott Workshops, Portmanmoor Road  
Willowbrook Technology Park, Llandogo Road

#### **Wards**

Grangetown  
Butetown  
Fairwater  
Fairwater  
Gabalfa  
Rumney  
Butetown  
Splott  
St Mellons

13. Occupancy of workshops is high, with 96% occupancy rate in Quarter 1 2018/19. The demand for workshops is high, with a waiting list of over 160 companies, the majority of which are waiting for a light industrial/ industrial unit from 500-1,500 sq. ft.

## Issues

14. The Council provision detailed above mostly dates from the 1980s and 1990s.

More recently, additional premises for innovation have been developed by universities and by the private sector. These include:

- i) Cardiff University – Innovation Campus – details available at:  
<https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/innovation/campus-investment>
- ii) Eagle Labs – details available at:  
<https://labs.uk.barclays/locations/cardiff-en>
- iii) Espark – details available at:  
<https://www.entrepreneurial-spark.com/>
- iv) Tramshed Tech– details available at:  
<http://www.tramshedtech.co.uk/index>

15. As part of the Inquiry, Councillor G Hill-John and Councillor Robson have visited a number of the workshop sites to see the range of sizes and types of units provided and to meet with businesses to hear their views on the existing provision.

16. During discussion of this item, Members may wish to seek the views of university representatives on:

- i) What should Cardiff Council's role be re provision of workshops?
- ii) Are there any overlaps and/or gaps in provision between the Council and other provision of workshops?
- iii) What should Cardiff Council's role be re provision of innovation premises?
- iv) Are there any overlaps and/or gaps in provision between the Council and other provision of innovation premises?
- v) Is there anything else that witnesses would like to bring to the attention of the Committee regarding workshop and innovation premises provision in Cardiff?

## **Way Forward**

17. Representatives from Cardiff University and the University of South Wales have been invited to attend the meeting to discuss their views on what they think the role of the Council should be in the provision of workshop and innovation premises.

## **Legal Implications**

18. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## **Financial Implications**

19. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

**Recommendation**

The Committee is recommended to consider the information received during the meeting and agree a way forward.

**DAVINA FIORE****Director of Governance & Legal Services****7 September 2018**

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol



**Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee - Scrutiny Investigation Summary Sheet**

TOPIC: COUNCIL WORKSHOPS & INNOVATION PREMISES					
TYPE OF SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION: Inquiry					
<b>Proposed Terms of Reference</b>		<p>To investigate what the Council's role should be in the provision of workshop premises and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff, by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Examining current council provision – e.g. location/ unit size/ demand/ property condition</li><li>- Examining alternative provision – currently available and planned</li><li>- Identifying whether there are overlaps and/ or gaps in provision</li><li>- Exploring the role the Council wishes to play in addressing the above</li><li>- Hearing the views of stakeholders with regard to the above.</li></ul> <p>To make evidence-based recommendations to Cabinet on the future role of the Council re provision of workshops and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff.</p>			
<b>Number of meetings required</b>					
<b>Meeting 1</b> (19 July 2018)		<b>Scoping and Planning</b> <i>Briefing report – giving an overview of existing council provision of workshops and CBTC Ltd.</i> <i>Planning discussion – identifying additional information required and approach to take to maximise opportunity for stakeholder input, given timescales of Inquiry.</i>			
<b>Meeting 2</b> (14 August 2018)		<b>Workshops Visits</b> <i>Visits to Douglas and Royal Stuart workshops (Butetown), Gabalfa workshops (Western Avenue), Willowbrook workshops (St Mellons) and Bessemer workshops (Leckwith), including meetings with some tenant businesses to hear their views.</i>			
<b>Meeting 3</b>		<b>Obtain views from Stakeholders</b> <i>Invite written and verbal contributions from a range of stakeholders including:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Businesses – FSB, CBI, Cardiff Start, Creative Cardiff</li><li>- Universities – Cardiff, Cardiff Met, South Wales</li><li>- Other providers – E-spark, Eagle Labs, Tramshed Tech, ICE (Caerphilly),</li><li>- Welsh Government</li></ul>			
<b>Meeting 4</b> (19 September 2018)		<b>Presentation from relevant Cabinet Members / Officers</b> <i>To hear evidence from Cllr Goodway, Neil Hanratty and Ken Poole regarding:</i> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. <i>Current provision and potential way forward, including views on:</i><ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. <i>Whether the Council should keep current provision or sell some/ all?</i></li><li>b. <i>How the Council could best use any monies raised from any disposals of existing provision?</i></li></ol></li><li>2. <i>Progress/ Changes re implementing agreed recommendations, as set out in report to Cabinet 11 December 2014 'Cabinet Response to the Report by the Economy &amp; Culture Scrutiny Committee entitled 'Higher Education Innovation in Cardiff'.</i></li></ol>			
<b>Meeting 5</b>		<b>Consideration of Additional Evidence</b> <i>To review findings from market research re private sector provision and other</i>			
4.SS.01c	Issue 2	Date: 08/06	Process Owner: Chief Officer Scrutiny, Change & Efficiency	Authorisation: Scrutiny OM	Page 1 of 1

	<p><i>additional evidence requested during course of Inquiry</i></p> <p><b>Sum Up Meeting</b></p> <p><i>To consider all information received during the Inquiry and agree way forward for draft report/recommendations</i></p>
--	--

<p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>Proposed Reporting Arrangements</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Investigation to be undertaken between July and September 2018</li> <li>Report to be considered by the Scrutiny Committee – October 2018</li> <li>Report from Scrutiny to Cabinet - October 2018</li> </ul>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>Potential Outputs/Outcomes from this investigation</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Evidence based recommendations to Cabinet on the future role of the Council re provision of workshops and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff.</b></li> </ul>

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD**  
**CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**13 SEPTEMBER 2018**

---

**WORK PROGRAMME AND WEBCASTING 2018 – 19**

---

**Purpose of the Report**

1. To provide Members of the Committee with a Work Programme for consideration and approval based on discussions held at the work-programming forum meeting on 5 July 2018 and subsequently with officers and Members.
2. To enable Members to identify which items they feel would merit webcasting in order to support public engagement with scrutiny.

**Background**

3. The Council's Constitution (*Scrutiny Procedure Rule 7*) states that each Scrutiny Committee will set its own work programme. Members construct a work programme that most effectively uses the Committee's time, by considering items within the Committee's terms of reference where scrutiny can make a difference.
4. This Committee's terms of reference include:
 

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cardiff City Region City Deal</li> <li>• Inward Investment &amp; the Marketing of Cardiff</li> <li>• Economic Strategy &amp; Employment</li> <li>• European Funding &amp; Investment</li> <li>• Small to Medium Enterprises</li> <li>• Cardiff Harbour Authority</li> <li>• Lifelong Learning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Leisure Centres</li> <li>• Sports Development</li> <li>• Parks &amp; Green Spaces</li> <li>• Libraries, Arts &amp; Culture</li> <li>• Civic Buildings</li> <li>• Events &amp; Tourism</li> <li>• Strategic Projects</li> <li>• Innovation &amp; Technology Centres</li> <li>• Local Training &amp; Enterprise.</li> </ul>
---	--

5. This Committee's terms of reference also include the ability to '*assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery*'.
6. Scrutiny plays an essential role in promoting accountability, efficiency and effectiveness in the Council's decision-making process and the way in which it delivers services. The main roles of the Scrutiny Committees are:
  - i) Holding to account the Cabinet and officers, as decision-makers.
  - ii) Being a '*critical friend*', questioning how decisions have been made, providing a '*check and balance*' to decision makers and undertaking reviews of services and policy.
  - iii) Providing a voice for citizens.

### **Identification of potential items**

7. At their Committee Meeting on 14 June 2018, Members decided to hold a work-programming forum to consider and prioritise potential items. Members tasked the scrutiny officer to prepare a schedule of potential items in advance of this meeting, by:
  - i) seeking suggestions from all Members;
  - ii) reviewing the items recommended by the previous Committee;
  - iii) reviewing corporate documents, forthcoming legislation, the work programmes of relevant auditors, inspectors and regulators, partnership, consortia and regional documents; and
  - iv) checking other relevant documentation to identify areas within the terms of reference for the Committee.
8. The Chair, Councillor Nigel Howells, also offered to meet with Cabinet Members whose portfolios cover areas within the Committee terms of reference, in order to hear their suggestions for scrutiny; the key challenges they faced for 2018/19; and

how they felt the Committee could best constructively assist in addressing these and driving improvement.

9. Suggestions were received from the following Members and officers:

- i) Cabinet Members: Councillors Bradbury, Goodway, Merry and Thorne;
- ii) Other Members: Councillors Bale, Robson and Stubbs;
- iii) Directors: Neil Hanratty, Sarah McGill.

### **Initial prioritisation of items**

10. Members considered the schedule of potential items at their work programming forum meeting on 5 July 2018. Committee Members discussed which of these suggestions to prioritise for inclusion in the draft work programme, considering factors such as:

- i) The potential impact of scrutiny;
- ii) Importance to the citizens of Cardiff;
- iii) Importance for Cardiff Council;
- iv) Whether the possible item would be dealt with in other arenas; and
- v) The resources available from Scrutiny Services and the capacity of Members to undertake the scrutiny.

11. Committee Members considered the most appropriate type of scrutiny tool to use for each of the prioritised items, bearing in mind the WAO advice<sup>1</sup> to aim to achieve committee meetings that last no longer than three hours, whilst maintaining robust, appropriate scrutiny across the terms of reference by undertaking scrutiny outside of committee meetings.

12. Members discussed potential ideas for task groups and prioritised the following:

- i) Council Provision of Innovation and Workshop Premises – *July–September 2018 – Cllrs Howells, G Hill-John and Robson*
- ii) Events – *October–December 2018 – Cllrs Gordon, Henshaw and Parkhill*

---

<sup>1</sup> Advice received following WAO Corporate Assessment (September 2014)

- iii) Sports – Use of Schools and Condition of Grounds and Facilities –  
*January–March 2019 – Cllrs Howells and Stubbs, with invitation to  
be offered to Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee  
Members to sit on the task group if they wish to.*

13. Committee Members tasked the Principal Scrutiny Officer to prepare a draft work programme based on their decisions, for agreement at this meeting and to scope the first two inquiries with Committee Members.

14. The draft work programme is attached at **Appendix A**, with items split into the following work areas:

Committee Meeting Items:

- **Policy Development / Policy Review/ Pre-decision Scrutiny** - Where the Committee contributes to the Council's policy development processes by considering green papers or draft policy documents, reviews the progress made in implementing agreed Council policies, or evaluates and comments on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to receive and consider Scrutiny Members views prior to making their decision.
- **Committee Business Items** – enabling Members to consider items of Committee business, such as work programming, task group reports, correspondence reports and the Committee's Annual Report.

Items dealt with outside Committee Meetings:

- **Committee Improvement Inquiries** - Where the Committee establishes a Task Group to examine a topic, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. These can be short inquiries, such as deep dives, or longer inquiries, as required.
- **Briefings/ Information Reports** – Where the Committee receives reports for information in order to guide future scrutiny and/ or determine if further scrutiny is required. This includes corporate and directorate performance and budget monitoring reports.

15. A schedule listing the items considered by the work-programming forum and summarising the decisions taken is attached at **Appendix B**.

### **Final prioritisation and rationalisation**

16. The initial prioritisation identified a number of items that could be included in the work programme; these are marked as '*Maybe*' in **Appendix B**. Members are invited to consider whether any of these items warrant inclusion in the final work programme. These items are:

- i) Possible Committee items:
  - i. Flatholm
  - ii. Parks
  - iii. Sports
  - iv. Business Forum
- ii) Items outside Committee meetings:
  - i. Cardiff Castle – Joint Venture
  - ii. Impact of M4 tolls removal on Cardiff
  - iii. Cardiff Commitment.

17. Members are invited to consider whether any further amendments are required to the draft work programme attached at **Appendix A**. Members are reminded of the need to retain some flexibility in the work programme to enable new items to be added to the work programme during the year as necessary.

### **Identifying Items for Webcasting**

18. The Welsh Government has identified webcasting as a useful tool in encouraging and supporting public engagement with scrutiny. At a recent Scrutiny Chairs Liaison Forum, the Head of Democratic Services identified that there are twenty-four hours of webcast available for scrutiny in the remainder of this financial year. Scrutiny Chairs agreed that they would seek Committee Members views on which items they felt would be of most interest to the public and therefore warrant webcasting.

19. Should the number of items identified by the Scrutiny Committees to be webcast exceed the hours available, the Scrutiny Chairs, the Head of Communications and the Head of Democratic Services will prioritise those items that will be webcast.
20. Therefore, Members are invited to identify and agree which items from their work programme they would like to submit for consideration for webcasting.

### **Scoping Inquiries**

21. As agreed at the work programme forum, Councillor Howells, Councillor G Hill-John and Councillor Robson have met to scope the Innovation & Workshop Inquiry. Given the tight timescales for undertaking and completing the Inquiry, Members agreed at the work programme forum that the scope and terms of reference would be finalised via email; these have been sent to all Committee Members and are attached at **Appendix C**.
22. Councillor Gordon, Councillor Henshaw and Councillor Parkhill met on 4 September to discuss the scope for the Events inquiry. The terms of reference and high-level project plan for this Inquiry are being finalised and will be brought to the October committee meeting for formal sign-off.

### **Way Forward**

23. Members will have the opportunity to discuss the information provided in **Appendices A and B**, and agree whether any amendments to the work programme are required. Members will also have the opportunity to identify which items they feel would merit webcasting in order to support public engagement with scrutiny.

### **Legal Implications**

24. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising



from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## **Financial Implications**

25. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

## **Recommendation**

The Committee is recommended to:

- a) consider the contents of **Appendix A and Appendix B**, agree any amendments required and approve a final work programme;
- b) approve the nominations of Councillor Nigel Howells, Councillor Gavin Hill-John and Councillor Robson to sit on the '*Council Provision of Innovation and Workshop Premises*' Inquiry;
- c) approve the nominations of Councillor Iona Gordon, Councillor Jane Henshaw and Councillor Thomas Parkhill to sit on the '*Events*' Inquiry; and
- d) identify and agree which items to put forward for possible webcasting.

**DAVINA FIORE**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**7 September 2018**

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

## Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee - Work Programme 2018/2019 - indicative

COMMITTEE MEETINGS	20 August (forum)	13 Sept (CR4)	11 October (CR4)	8 November (CR4 )	6 December (CR4)	17 January (CR4 )	Budget meeting 19 February Tuesday 4.30pm (CR4)	14 March (CR4)	4 April (CR4)	9 May (CR4)	6 June (CR4)	4 July (CR4)
Pre-Decision/ Policy Development / Review	ACL Response to WG Consultation	Innovation - Universities perspectives	Cabinet Response - Parks	Economic Development White Paper	Employment Services	GLL scrutiny	Budget Proposals	Cardiff Sport and Physical Activity Strategy	Metro Central - Cardiff Central Station			
			Historic Assets Business Plan		Multi Purpose Indoor Arena	City Centre & Bay - links/ interface/ highline	Corporate Plan	Library Strategy				
			Dumballs Road		Cardiff Bus Station	ISV Cardiff Bay Regeneration						
Committee Business Items		Work Programme & Webcasting	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence		Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence
		Performance	Innovation etc Inquiry report			Events Inquiry report				Annual Report		
OUTSIDE COMMITTEE MEETINGS	August	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	March	Apr	May	June	July
Committee Improvement Inquiries	Innovation/ Workshops Inquiry		Events Inquiry			Sports Inquiry						
Briefings/ information reports outside Committee		Month 3 budget monitoring	Month 4 budget monitoring	Changes to Libraries & Hubs	Month 6 budget monitoring		Month 9 budget monitoring					Outturn budget monitoring
		Q1 Performance		Libraries Standards & Universal Offers	Q2 Performance monitoring			Q3 Performance			Q4 Performance	

Timing TBC

WAO Leisure Services report

Cardiff Business Forum

Cardiff Harbour Authority

City Deal

Channel View Estate Regen

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwiadol

## Decisions

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

## E&C Work Programme 2018-19: Decisions taken at Forum Meeting 5-7-18

<u>Proposed Committee Items</u>	<u>Likely Timing</u>	<u>Notes of Discussion</u>
<b>DEFINITE ITEMS:</b>		
• Dumballs Road – master planning.	October	Explore fit with/ impact on wider Economic Development strategy and proposals set out in Green Paper
❖ Cabinet Response to Parks Inquiry.	October	
❖ Cardiff Bus Station	Oct/ Nov/Dec	Invite Transport for Wales/ Developer as well as internal witnesses – liaise with Environmental Scrutiny Committee to ensure no duplication
❖ Historic Assets Business Plan (City Hall/ Mansion House/ Norwegian Church etc.) (& <i>Cllr Bale suggestion</i> )	Oct/ Nov	This Committee if item focuses on marketing/ conferences etc. OR joint with PRAP if also covers asset management/corporate landlord
• Leckwith Sports Cluster – master planning.	Nov	Include in Economic Development White Paper work
• Economic Development White Paper.	Nov	Include exploring Leckwith sports cluster/ Industrial Strategy / Knowledge Corridor/City Centre & Bay links/ Culture Strategy/ Creative Industries. Want to be able to add value – need for additional information to enable this/ hear from external witnesses. Interested in having forum meetings/ working group outside Committee.
❖ Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena.	Nov/ Dec	Want to understand <i>how</i> will be delivered (as well as <i>when</i> and <i>where</i> ) and impact for Council

## Decisions

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

## Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

<b><u>Proposed Committee Items</u></b>	<b><u>Likely Timing</u></b>	<b><u>Notes of Discussion</u></b>
❖ International Sports Village/ Cardiff Bay Regeneration.	Nov/ Dec	Interested in how these will attract visitors/ add to offer of Cardiff re tourists. Link to item on Channel View estate plans. Include looking at Penarth Headland link ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )
➤ Employment Services – Progress report.	December	As requested at previous scrutiny and discussed with Cllr Thorne
• City Centre & the Bay – links/ interface	By Christmas	Reference Economic Development White Paper work
➤ Industrial Strategy - East Cardiff.	Jan – March	Include in Economic Development White Paper work Include St Mellon's Business Park & Train station (Cllr Bale)
❖ Metro Central - Cardiff Central Station.	March/ April	Interface with Bus Station and surrounding developments such as Brains Site/ Quay etc.
❖ CCR City Deal - Metro Delivery Partnership, Skills & Employment, Innovation, Regeneration & Infrastructure.	TBC	Ensure no duplication with JOSE & that scrutinise issues that need to, re Cardiff.
❖ Cardiff Harbour Authority.	TBC	Awaiting decision from Welsh Government re remit of review/ timing of review – Members want to explore impact for CHA and for Cardiff Council and Cardiff as a whole
• GLL (& see <i>Member suggestion</i> ).	Flexible	Schedule for January. Members want to check progress on delivery against contract, including capital programme, usage levels and other info as listed in previous scrutiny. In addition, Cllr Stubbs would like to know if

## Decisions

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<b><u>Proposed Committee Items</u></b>	<b><u>Likely Timing</u></b>	<b><u>Notes of Discussion</u></b>
		any impact on public sector bodies being able to use GLL buildings. Scrutiny officer to check contract terms and conditions re this.
• Historic Venues –City Hall/ Mansion House.	Flexible	Covered by Historic Assets Business Plan item listed above.
• Channel View Estate.	Flexible	Incorporate into work re ISV/ Cardiff Bay regeneration. May need to be joint with CASSC.
❖ Relevant Audit, Inspection and Regulatory Reports.	reactive	If anything emerges – nothing other than WAO report detailed below.
<b>POSSIBLE ITEMS (MAYBE):</b>		
• Flatholm (& see <i>Member suggestion</i> ).	Flexible	Due to hear from Heritage Lottery Fund September 2018 – if bid not successful, scrutiny would be of help.
• Parks.	Flexible	Depends on Cabinet Response to Inquiry
• Sports.	Flexible	Wait to see what Sport Wales propose re Cardiff and if scrutiny required, See later item re possible task group Inquiry
• Business Forum.	Longer Term	Would like to look at proposals when these are developed and available for scrutiny

## Decisions

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<b><u>Proposed Committee Items</u></b>	<b><u>Likely Timing</u></b>	<b><u>Notes of Discussion</u></b>
<b>DEFINITELY NOT (NO):</b>		
• BID – For Cardiff.	Flexible	Members see this as successful – no scrutiny needed.
• Channel View Leisure Centre	Flexible	Members see this as successful – no scrutiny needed
• Cultural Venues – St David's/ New Theatre.	Flexible	Members aware changes to date and will wait to see impact on performance. Issues re how work together and attract visitors will be explored in Events Inquiry – see later item.
• Funding Flexibilities Pathfinder project.	Flexible	



## Decisions

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<u>Outside of Committee</u>	<u>Timing</u>	<u>Notes of Discussion</u>
➤ Adult Community Learning	August	<p><b>Forum meeting</b></p> <p>To consider draft response to Welsh Government re their consultation on changes to ACL. Committee want to be able to offer support to Council in arguing to keep ACL provision in Cardiff, which is of benefit to citizens &amp; economy.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Innovation – council provision</li> </ul>	July - Sept	<p><b>Task Group Inquiry - Cllrs Howells, G Hill-John and Robson</b></p> <p>Both of these may have overlapping witnesses/ evidence – therefore whilst explore each, undertake together and explore as strands under umbrella of SME support offered by Council. Meet to scope <b>Inquiry</b> asap. Needs to be completed asap to feed into report to Cabinet, which is due on October.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Workshop – council provision</li> </ul>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Events</li> </ul>	Prior to Budget	<p><b>Task Group Inquiry - Cllrs Gordon, Henshaw and Parkhill</b></p> <p>To look at strategy/ programme/resources and council role. To include consideration of Culture Strategy &amp; Music Strategy – Cllr Parkhill has attended consultation on this and aware of discussions re 'signature event'. Will cover issues re High Street Footfall and Visitor Stays (<i>Cllr Robson</i>)</p> <p>Meet to scope <b>Inquiry</b> asap.</p>

## Decisions

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

<u>Outside of Committee</u>	<u>Timing</u>	<u>Notes of Discussion</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use of schools for sports (<i>Cllr Stubbs</i>)</li> <li>• Sports Grounds &amp; Sports changing room facilities – condition, maintenance and investment (<i>Cllr Bale</i>)</li> </ul>	Once the above inquiries are completed.	<b>Task Group Inquiry – Cllrs Howells, Stubbs and possible CYP Member</b> Interested in exploring use of schools for sport by community post 4pm. Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee members to be invited to join task group. Also, Inquiry to cover areas suggested by Cllr Bale.
❖ Libraries –Central, branch, hubs, Strategy.	Nov/ Dec	<b>Briefing</b> Members are happy with proposed changes as detailed to date – do not feel there is a need for additional scrutiny – would want to have briefing on final proposals – only scrutinise if issues arise/ by exception. If service area request, liaise with Chair.
❖ Welsh Library Standards.	Nov/ Dec	<b>Performance Monitoring</b> Members are happy with performance to date. Want to receive copy of CyMAL report and will pick up any issues that way. Will receive performance stats as part of corporate performance reports. Also want to receive performance stats previously provided as part of presentation – e.g. Reading Challenge performance & Universal Offers.

## Decisions

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<u>Outside of Committee</u>	<u>Timing</u>	<u>Notes of Discussion</u>
❖ Performance Reports – quarterly	Sept/ Dec/ March/June	<p><b>Performance Monitoring</b></p> <p>Receive corporate reports by email, with summary provided by scrutiny officer, and then use these to identify any areas where further scrutiny required.</p> <p>Separately, Members wish to have a meeting to look at possible changes to performance information to make reports more useful – including researching core cities' scrutiny of economic development performance information.</p>
❖ Savings Reports – assessing delivery and impact of agreed savings.	July/Sept/ Nov/ Feb	<p><b>Budget Monitoring</b></p> <p>Receive corporate reports by email, with summary provided by scrutiny officer, and then use these to identify any areas where further scrutiny required.</p>
• Ladywell – workshops.	Flexible	Include as part of research to support Innovation/ Workshop Inquiry

## Decisions

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<u>Member Suggestions</u>	<u>Yes/ No/ Maybe</u>	<u>Notes</u>
○ High Street Footfall – ( <i>Cllr Robson</i> )	Yes	Link to Events Inquiry – see above
○ Visitor stays - ( <i>Cllr Robson</i> )	Yes	
○ GLL – investigate whether impact on use of buildings by public sector ( <i>Cllr Stubbs</i> )	Yes	See earlier GLL item above
○ St Mellon's Business Park & Train Station ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	Yes	Include in scrutiny of Cardiff East Industrial Strategy
○ Penarth Headland Link project ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	Yes	Include in Cardiff Bay regeneration item – see above
○ Sports Grounds & Sports Changing Room Facilities in Cardiff - Condition, Maintenance & Future Investment Priorities ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	Yes	Tie into Use of schools for Sport inquiry, listed above.
○ Cardiff Castle JV - ( <i>Cllr Robson</i> )	Maybe	Scrutiny officer to check progress on this – bring to scrutiny if an issue
○ Flatholm Update ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	Maybe	See earlier Flatholm item above
○ Impact of M4 tolls removal on Cardiff ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	Maybe	Scrutiny officer to check modelling undertaken and what it shows.
○ Protecting Cardiff's heritage buildings and monuments ( <i>Cllr Bale</i> )	No	Some will be covered by Historic Assets work, but not all.

## Decisions

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

## Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

<u>Other Suggestions Received</u>	<u>Yes/ No/ Maybe</u>	<u>Notes</u>
Music Strategy – Corporate Plan 2018-2021/ Economic Development Delivery Plan 2018	Yes	Include in Events Inquiry – listed above
Culture Strategy – Corporate Plan 2018-2021	Yes	Include in Economic Development White Paper and Events Inquiry – listed above
Creative Industries Growth – Corporate Plan 2018-2021/ Economic Development Delivery Plan 2018	Yes	Include in Economic Development White Paper work
Knowledge Corridor – Economic Development Green Paper/ Economic Development Delivery Plan 2018	Yes	Include in Economic Development White Paper work
Cardiff Sport and Physical Activity Strategic Plan – Economic Development Delivery Plan 2018	Yes	Schedule for March committee
WAO Review of Leisure Services – planned for 2018/19 – part of ‘Delivering with Less’ programme	Yes	Not likely to be available till 2019/20 but if available prior to that, receive at Committee.
Cardiff Commitment – Corporate Plan 2018-2021/ Economic Development Delivery Plan 2018	Maybe	Would like to receive information briefing on this
Capita Project – linking data across Council re educational attainment/ poverty/ employment	No	
Inclusive Cities – Employability/ ESOL/ Volunteering	No	

**Decisions**

Appendix B – work programme item 13/9/18

- ❖ Annual Report 2017-18
- Chair's letters 2017-18
- Cabinet Member suggestion
- Member suggestion

<u>Other Suggestions Received</u>	<u>Yes/ No/ Maybe</u>	<u>Notes</u>
Inclusive Growth – PSB Wellbeing Plan / Corporate Plan	No	
Impact of Brexit/ Shared Prosperity Fund – PSB Wellbeing Plan	No	
Regeneration Initiatives – Neighbourhood Regeneration/ TRIP – Corporate Plan 2018-2021	No	

**Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee - Scrutiny Investigation Summary Sheet**

TOPIC: COUNCIL WORKSHOPS & INNOVATION PREMISES					
TYPE OF SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION: Inquiry					
<b>Proposed Terms of Reference</b>		<p>To investigate what the Council's role should be in the provision of workshop premises and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff, by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Examining current council provision – e.g. location/ unit size/ demand/ property condition</li><li>- Examining alternative provision – currently available and planned</li><li>- Identifying whether there are overlaps and/ or gaps in provision</li><li>- Exploring the role the Council wishes to play in addressing the above</li><li>- Hearing the views of stakeholders with regard to the above.</li></ul> <p>To make evidence-based recommendations to Cabinet on the future role of the Council re provision of workshops and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff.</p>			
Number of meetings required					
<b>Meeting 1</b> (19 July 2018)		<b>Scoping and Planning</b>  <i>Briefing report – giving an overview of existing council provision of workshops and CBTC Ltd.</i>  <i>Planning discussion – identifying additional information required and approach to take to maximise opportunity for stakeholder input, given timescales of Inquiry.</i>			
<b>Meeting 2</b> (14 August 2018)		<b>Workshops Visits</b>  <i>Visits to Douglas and Royal Stuart workshops (Butetown), Gabalfa workshops (Western Avenue), Willowbrook workshops (St Mellons) and Bessemer workshops (Leckwith), including meetings with some tenant businesses to hear their views.</i>			
<b>Meeting 3</b>		<b>Obtain views from Stakeholders</b>  <i>Invite written and verbal contributions from a range of stakeholders including:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- <i>Businesses – FSB, CBI, Cardiff Start, Creative Cardiff</i></li><li>- <i>Universities – Cardiff, Cardiff Met, South Wales</i></li><li>- <i>Other providers – E-spark, Eagle Labs, Tramshed Tech, ICE (Caerphilly), Welsh Government</i></li></ul>			
<b>Meeting 4</b> (19 September 2018)		<b>Presentation from relevant Cabinet Members / Officers</b>  <i>To hear evidence from Cllr Goodway, Neil Hanratty and Ken Poole regarding:</i> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li><i>Current provision and potential way forward, including views on:</i><ol style="list-style-type: none"><li><i>Whether the Council should keep current provision or sell some/ all?</i></li><li><i>How the Council could best use any monies raised from any disposals of existing provision?</i></li></ol></li><li><i>Progress/ Changes re implementing agreed recommendations, as set out in report to Cabinet 11 December 2014 'Cabinet Response to the Report by the Economy &amp; Culture Scrutiny Committee entitled 'Higher Education Innovation in Cardiff'.</i></li></ol>			
<b>Meeting 5</b>		<b>Consideration of Additional Evidence</b>  <i>To review findings from market research re private sector provision and other</i>			
4.SS.01c	Issue 2	Date: 08/06	Process Owner: Chief Officer Scrutiny, Change & Efficiency	Authorisation: Scrutiny OM	Page 1 of 1

	<p><i>additional evidence requested during course of Inquiry</i></p> <p><b>Sum Up Meeting</b></p> <p><i>To consider all information received during the Inquiry and agree way forward for draft report/recommendations</i></p>
--	--

<p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>Proposed Reporting Arrangements</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Investigation to be undertaken between July and September 2018</li> <li>• Report to be considered by the Scrutiny Committee – October 2018</li> <li>• Report from Scrutiny to Cabinet - October 2018</li> </ul>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>Potential Outputs/Outcomes from this investigation</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Evidence based recommendations to Cabinet on the future role of the Council re provision of workshops and premises for supporting innovation in Cardiff.</b></li> </ul>



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD**  
**CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**13 SEPTEMBER 2018**

---

**PERFORMANCE: Briefing Paper – Overview of Core Cities' Economic Development Performance Indicators**

---

**Purpose of the Report**

1. To provide Members of the Committee with information regarding the economic development performance indicators reported to scrutiny at a number of other core cities.
2. To enable Members to discuss the information provided and the way forward on this issue.

**Background**

3. Scrutiny Committees are responsible for scrutinising performance, thereby facilitating challenge and public discussion, to help drive improvement in service provision. Scrutiny consideration of performance provides the following benefits:
  - i) Ensures senior managers and Cabinet Members remain accountable for, and therefore focused on, performance management.
  - ii) Fosters an ongoing dialogue on delivery of services/ customer experience.
  - iii) Members are able to identify where performance measures are inadequate and to suggest alternative measures that are more 'fit for purpose'.
  - iv) Members can highlight the importance of effectively using customer feedback.
  - v) Members can question equality and equity issues re performance, seeking assurance that there is an aim to equalise outcomes to overcome inequalities.
  - vi) Overall – the above benefits help to drive improvement, support value for money, and result in improved outcomes for Cardiff.

4. At the 14 June 2018 committee meeting, Members received the Quarter 4 Corporate Performance Report and the Economic Development Directorate Delivery Plan 2018-19, which lists the performance indicators to be reported in 2018/19. Members discussed with relevant Cabinet Members and the Director of Economic Development whether scrutiny was receiving the right suite of indicators. Officers advised Members that considerable work had been undertaken to ensure that reported performance indicators focused on the areas within the control of the Council and captured the impact of the work of the Council's Economic Development directorate. The Director of Economic Development stated that he was open to the Committee carrying out investigative work to see if other performance indicators would be useful and helpful.
5. Following this, at the work programming forum meeting on 5 July 2018, Committee Members tasked scrutiny officers to collate the economic development performance indicators reported to scrutiny in other Core Cities.

### **Core Cities**

6. An initial desk-based review of economic development performance indicators reported to scrutiny in core cities, undertaken by scrutiny research, identified information for Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Leeds and Sheffield. To assist comparison, the committee's scrutiny officer has grouped the performance indicators into the following categories:
  - i) Businesses
  - ii) Development (Enterprise Zones in Birmingham)
  - iii) Economic Activity
  - iv) GVA
  - v) Infrastructure
  - vi) Living Wage
  - vii) Skills
  - viii) Visitor Economy
7. The information is attached at **Appendix A** and shows that the number of performance indicators reported to scrutiny ranges from nine in Leeds to 32 in Sheffield. The mix of indicators within these categories varies across the core

cities. All the core cities report indicators for the 'Economic Activity' category but only Manchester has a 'Living Wage' indicator. Out of these five core cities, four of them report indicators in the following categories:

- i) Businesses – *except for Manchester*
- ii) GVA – *except for Birmingham*
- iii) Skills – *except for Manchester*
- iv) Visitor Economy – *except for Birmingham.*

8. For ease of reference, the economic development performance indicators that will be reported in Cardiff Council's corporate performance reports 2018-19 are:

- i) Businesses –
  - i. New and safeguarded jobs in businesses supported by the Council, financially or otherwise
- ii) Development –
  - i. 'Grade A' office space committed to in Cardiff (sq. ft.)
- iii) Skills -
  - i. The number of clients that have been supported into employment having received tailored support through the Gateway.
  - ii. The number of employers that have been assisted by the Council's employment support service.
- iv) Visitor Economy -
  - i. Number of staying visitors
  - ii. Total visitor numbers
  - iii. Attendance at Commercial Venues<sup>1</sup>

9. Cardiff Council's corporate performance report also includes the following indicators relating to Skills e.g. education and apprenticeships:

- i) Skills -
  - i. The percentage of pupils achieving the Level 2+ threshold at the end of Key Stage 4 (pupils achieving 5 GCSEs A\*-C including English or Welsh and Mathematics)

---

<sup>1</sup> This includes: St David's Hall, New Theatre, Cardiff Castle, Mansion House and Cardiff Story Museum

- ii. The percentage of pupils achieving the Level 1 threshold at the end of Key Stage 4 (5 GCSEs A\*-G)
- iii. The percentage of Year 11 leavers making a successful transition from compulsory schooling to education, employment or training
- iv. The number of opportunities created for paid apprenticeships and trainees within the Council.

## **Issues**

10. During discussion of this item, Members may wish to reflect on the following:

- i) The need to ensure that performance indicators are appropriate in that they focus on areas within the control of the Council
- ii) That performance indicators reported to this Committee reflect the terms of reference for this Committee and therefore do not include all the indicators relating to Skills levels
- iii) That there may be a resource implication to collect and collate additional performance information
- iv) That further advice would need to be sought from the Economic Development Directorate if Members felt alternative performance information could be beneficial.

## **Way Forward**

11. Members have the opportunity to discuss the information provided in **Appendix A**, and whether further scrutiny is required.

## **Legal Implications**

12. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural

requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

13. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

### **Recommendation**

The Committee is recommended to discuss the information provided in **Appendix A** and whether further scrutiny is required and agree a way forward.

**DAVINA FIORE**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**7 September 2018**

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Local Authority	Local Authority Economic Development Performance Indicator	FREQUENCY OF MEASURE
<b>BRISTOL CITY COUNCIL</b>	<b>10 KPIs: Bristol City Council is currently undertaking a review of its performance reporting system. No performance reports have been submitted to scrutiny in the last year. Previously, scrutiny received the Outturn Performance Report.</b>	
Businesses	Increase the proportion of new business registrations per 1,000 working age population	Annual
Businesses	Delivery of a range of projects to support the development and viability of Bristol's High Streets and Local Centres	Ongoing
Economic Activity	Overall employment rate of working age population	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Worklessness rate differentials in Bristol	Quarterly
GVA	Increase the economic output measured by annual Gross Value Added (GVA) (£m)	Annual
Skills	Reduce the percentage of adults with no formal qualifications	Annual
Skills	Percentage of 17 to 21 year old care leavers in EET (statutory return - recorded around birthday)	Quarterly
Skills	Percentage of 17 to 21 year old care leavers in EET (open referrals)	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Number of tourists to the city	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Number of visitors to Bristol Museums Galleries and Archives service	Quarterly
<b>BIRMINGHAM CITY COUNCIL</b>	<b>17 KPIs: reported to scrutiny via Quarterly Reports measuring progress in delivering Council Plan Vision &amp; Priorities and Service Delivery measures</b>	
Business	Private sector investment through the Business Growth Programme	Annual
Economic Activity	Reducing the unemployment gap between Wards	Annual
Economic Activity	Number of Jobs created through the Business Growth Programme	Annual
Enterprise Zones	Private sector investment in the Enterprise Zones	Annual
Enterprise Zones	Enterprises landing in the Enterprise Zone sites as a result of investment in infrastructure and development activity	Annual
Enterprise Zones	Number of jobs created and/or safeguarded as a result of investment in infrastructure and development activity in the Enterprise Zone	Annual

Local Authority	Local Authority Economic Development Performance Indicator	FREQUENCY OF MEASURE
Enterprise Zones	New employment floor space created and/or refurbished floor space (sq.m.) as a result of investment in infrastructure and development activity in the Enterprise Zone	Annual
Enterprise Zones	Land Developed (hectares) and number of new jobs created within the Economic Zones. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Aston RIS/Advanced Manufacturing Hub (AMH)</li> <li>- Selly Oak</li> <li>- Tyseley Environmental Enterprise District</li> <li>- Food Hub</li> <li>- Longbridge</li> </ul>	Annual
Infrastructure	Land developed (hectares), jobs created and new employment floor space created as a result of investment in infrastructure and development activity	Annual
Infrastructure	Improved digital offer across Birmingham - work more closely with the Greater Birmingham & Solihull LEP and West Midlands Combined Authority to develop a digital and Smart City approach	Annual
Infrastructure	Public sector infrastructure investment to support development activity in the Enterprise Zone	Annual
Skills	Number of people supported into education/training & employment through employment support activity	Annual
Skills	The percentage increase in apprenticeships within other organisations through our influence on contract management	Annual
Skills	The number of Birmingham City Council apprenticeships directly within the City Council	Annual
Skills	The proportion of years 12 to 13 not in employment, education or training	Annual
Skills	Proportion of the population aged 16 to 24 qualified to at least level 1 (see commentary for list of eligible qualifications)	Annual
Skills	Proportion of the population aged 16 to 24 qualified to at least level 3 (see commentary for list of eligible qualifications)	Annual



Local Authority	Local Authority Economic Development Performance Indicator	FREQUENCY OF MEASURE
<b>MANCHESTER CITY COUNCIL</b>	<b>18 KPIs: Economy Dashboard - produced quarterly</b>	
Development	Number of schemes under construction	Quarterly
Development	New Starts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Hotel</li> <li>- Residential</li> <li>- Office</li> </ul>	Quarterly
Development	Hotel development number of bedrooms	Quarterly
Development	Residential development number of units	Quarterly
Development	Office space availability	Quarterly
Development	Office take up	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Percentage of Manchester adults that are economically active/ economically inactive	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Percentage of Manchester's working age population accessing out of work benefits	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Number of employees working in Manchester	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Number of full time/ part time employees	Quarterly
Economic Activity	Vacancies by sector	Quarterly
GVA	GVA per head of population	Quarterly
Living Wage	The proportion of Manchester residents earning less than the living wage	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Number of International visitors	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Increase in number of hotel rooms	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Hotel stock and occupancy	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Annual total volume of passengers flying from Manchester	Quarterly
Visitor Economy	Annual total volume of passenger s flying to financial centres from Manchester	Quarterly

Local Authority	Local Authority Economic Development Performance Indicator	FREQUENCY OF MEASURE
<b>LEEDS CITY COUNCIL</b>	<b>9 KPIs: Report to Scrutiny Board (Infrastructure, Investment and Inclusive Growth)</b>	
Businesses	Growth in Business Rates	
Businesses	Increased number of business start-ups (Calendar year)	
Economic Activity	Growth in jobs in the Leeds economy (Private sector only)	
GVA	Increased Productivity (£) (GVA Income	
Skills	More people supported to improve their skills	
Skills	More Leeds residents between 16-64 with at least a Level 4 qualification	
Skills	Average Progress 8 score (Key Stage 4)	
Skills	Percentage of students achieving a strong pass in English and in maths (key stage 4)	
Skills	Fewer young people not in education, employment or training (NEET)/not known	
<b>SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL</b>	<b>32 KPIs: Reported to Overview &amp; Scrutiny Management Committee annually</b>	
Businesses	The proportion of prestart businesses accessing the Gateway programme that convert into business starts	Annual
Businesses	Business stock growth	Annual
Business	Number of additional businesses	Annual
Business	Number of start ups	Annual
Business	Number of closures	Annual
Development	Hectares of land developed (office, non-office business, industrial)	Annual
Development	Rental Values (manufacturing, grade A office, retail)	Annual
Economic Activity	Economic inactivity	Annual
Economic Activity	Increase in employment in "job driving" sector	Annual
Economic Activity	Number of people employed in the GVA driving sector	Annual
Economic Activity	Net Job growth	Annual
Economic Activity	Index of multiple deprivation	Annual

Local Authority	Local Authority Economic Development Performance Indicator	FREQUENCY OF MEASURE
Economic Activity	Unemployment including youth employment	Annual
GVA	GVA (Gross Value Added) per head of population	Annual
GVA	GVA produced in “GVA driving sector”	Annual
GVA	GVA per job across economy	Annual
Skills	Number of people with level 3 and 4 skills	Annual
Skills	Number of apprenticeships	Annual
Skills	Number of people with level 2 skills	Annual
Skills	Reduce number of people with no skills	Annual
Skills	The number of graduates placed with local SME s under the RISE Programme	Annual
Skills	16-64 year old with no qualifications	Annual
Skills	Percentage of 16-17 year olds taking up apprenticeships	Annual
Visitor Economy	Number of visits in cultural venues	Annual
Visitor Economy	Volume and value of tourism	Annual
Visitor Economy	Hotel occupancy	Annual
Visitor Economy	Estimated value of business tourism (conferences and events) in Sheffield	Annual
Visitor Economy	The number of visits per 1,000 head of population to Sheffield funded cultural venue	Annual
Visitor Economy	Number of visits per 1000 population to SCC funded sporting venues and activities	Annual
Visitor Economy	Number of visits per 1,000 head of population to SCC cultural funded venues –year to date	Annual
Visitor Economy	Number of visitors to the Moor Markets (thousands) –year to date	Annual
Visitor Economy	Value of business tourism –conferences and events	Annual

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwiadol